

October 5, 2015

Dear Kathleen, dear Editors of the EBPH Journal,

Our scientific society SISMEC has been following since the beginning the exchange of letters and mails concerning the dispute regarding the two recent articles on asbestos published on EBPH, together with the letter of Corrado Magnani and the rebuttal of Ed Ilgren.

The Executive Committee of our Society has thoroughly discussed this issue in its last meeting, which has taken place on Sep 16th, in the occasion of the VIII National Congress of SISMEC in Turin.

We have acknowledged the extensive work made by Stefania Boccia in name of the Editorial Board of the Journal, which has enquired about the objections made by Corrado Magnani and other scientists to the articles by Ed. Ilgren and others, clarifying that the article was not published elsewhere and that the two references of the Ann Res Med of 2012 actually exist and do not have duplicate information.

As for the scientific content of the two articles, the Committee has expressed concern about their consistency and issued a warning concerning the peer-review process. Our Society has decided to engage in a serious commitment toward the safeguard of our ethical standards, which will oblige us to accurately consider the review procedure, in order to assure our readers that the process has been followed and that all ethical standards and the quality of the reviewers be well assessed.

A point which has raised our attention and concern refers to the reliability of a statement made in the Balangero article. We refer to the objection made by Corrado Magnani in his letter, where he underlines the falsity of a citation (pag. 5 of the Balangero paper):

“Crocidolite and amosite were also transferred to Balangero in jute bags [11]. “

Nothing similar can be found in Ref. 11, which is attached.

We have asked the Editors to publish an erratum and blame the authors for having altered the citation, giving a misleading interpretation of what was actually written.

Finally, we will ask the editors to publish a note from SISMEC, announcing the appointment of an ‘ad hoc’ commission, in accordance with the Editorial Board, for the safeguard of the ethical principles of the Journal and of the review process.

Sincerely

Franco Cavallo

President of SISMEC